# U.S. District Court U.S. District of Minnesota (DMN) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 0:18-cv-02493-WMW-BRT

Dorsey & Whitney LLP v. United States Postal Service

Assigned to: Judge Wilhelmina M. Wright

Referred to: Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 08/27/2018 Date Terminated: 09/03/2019

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of

Information Act

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

#### **Plaintiff**

**Dorsey & Whitney LLP** 

## represented by Alex P Hontos

Dorsey & Whitney LLP 50 S 6th St Ste 1500 Mpls, MN 55402–1498 612–492–6634 Fax: 612–677–3403

Email: hontos.alex@dorsey.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

## Caitlin L. D. Hull

Dorsey & Whitney LLP 50 South Sixth Street

Ste 1500

Minneapolis, MN 55402-1498

612–492–6773 Fax: 612–677–3299

Email: hull.caitlin@dorsev.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

#### **Defendant**

**United States Postal Service** 

## represented by Andrew Tweeten

United States Attorney's Office District of Minnesota 600 United States Courthouse 300 South Fourth Street Minneapolis, MN 55415 612-664-5655

Fax: 612–664–5788

Email: andrew.tweeten@usdoj.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/27/2018	1	COMPLAINT against United States Postal Service (filing fee \$ 400, receipt number AMNDC–6333215) filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. Filer requests summons issued. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit(s) A–D, # 2 Civil Cover Sheet) (Hontos, Alex) (Entered: 08/27/2018)
08/27/2018	2	RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. There is no parent corporation, publicly held corporation or wholly—owned subsidiary to report for Plaintiff Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Hontos, Alex) (Entered: 08/27/2018)

08/27/2018	3	TEXT ONLY ENTRY: CLERK'S NOTICE OF INITIAL CASE ASSIGNMENT. Case assigned to Judge Wilhelmina M. Wright per Civil (3rd, 4th – Master) list, referred to Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. Please use case number 18–cv–2493 (WMW/BRT). (lmb) (Entered: 08/27/2018)
08/27/2018	<u>4</u>	Summons Issued as to United States Postal Service. (lmb) (Entered: 08/27/2018)
08/28/2018		(Text–Only) NOTICE – Judge Wilhelmina M. Wright's Practice Pointers are available on the United States District Court for the District of Minnesota's <u>website</u> . All parties are expected to be familiar with and adhere to these Practice Pointers, including Judge Wright's deviations from the Local Rules with respect to motion scheduling and briefing deadlines. (TJB) (Entered: 08/28/2018)
08/28/2018	<u>5</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Andrew Tweeten on behalf of United States Postal Service. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 08/28/2018)
08/29/2018	<u>6</u>	SUMMONS Returned Executed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. United States Postal Service served on 8/27/2018, answer due 9/17/2018. (Hontos, Alex) (Entered: 08/29/2018)
08/29/2018	7	ORDER/NOTICE of Setting: Pretrial Conference set for 10/22/2018 at 03:00 PM in Courtroom 6A (STP) before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 8/29/2018. (Attachments: # 1 Consent Form) (MSK) (Entered: 08/29/2018)
09/26/2018	<u>8</u>	ANSWER to Complaint filed by United States Postal Service. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 09/26/2018)
10/12/2018	9	(Text–only) NOTICE of Resetting of Hearing, TIME CHANGE ONLY: The Pretrial Conference set for 10/22/2018 will begin at 10:30 AM in Courtroom 6A (STP) before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. (MSK) (Entered: 10/12/2018)
10/17/2018	<u>10</u>	REPORT of Rule 26(f) Planning Meeting. Filed by United States Postal Service. Jointly Signed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP.(Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 10/17/2018)
10/22/2018	<u>11</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 10/22/2018. (MSK) (Entered: 10/22/2018)
10/26/2018	<u>12</u>	ORDER/NOTICE of Setting: PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER. Amended Pleadings due by 10/31/2018. Joinder of Parties due by 10/31/2018. Motions (disp) due by 3/1/2019. Ready for trial due by 7/1/2019. Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 10/26/2018. (MSK) (Entered: 10/26/2018)
10/26/2018	<u>13</u>	ORDER/NOTICE of Setting: ORDER FOR SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE. Confidential Letter to Court due by 5/7/2019. Parties are directed to Meet and Confer by 5/1/2019. Settlement Conference set for 5/9/2019 at 09:30 AM in Courtroom 6A (STP) before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 10/26/2018. (MSK) (Entered: 10/26/2018)
11/09/2018	<u>14</u>	MOTION to Compel <i>Defendant to Produce a Vaughn Index Or, Alternatively, In Camera Review</i> filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 11/09/2018)
11/09/2018	<u>15</u>	NOTICE OF HEARING ON MOTION <u>14</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Defendant to Produce a Vaughn Index Or, Alternatively, In Camera Review</i> : Motion Hearing set for 12/18/2018 at 02:30 PM in Courtroom 6A (STP) before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. (Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 11/09/2018)
12/04/2018	<u>16</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support re 14 MOTION to Compel <i>Defendant to Produce a Vaughn Index Or, Alternatively, In Camera Review</i> filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Attachments: # 1 LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 12/04/2018)
12/04/2018	<u>17</u>	MEET and CONFER STATEMENT re <u>14</u> Motion to Compel filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP.(Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 12/04/2018)
12/04/2018	<u>18</u>	PROPOSED ORDER TO JUDGE re <u>14</u> MOTION to Compel <i>Defendant to Produce a Vaughn Index Or, Alternatively, In Camera Review</i> filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP.(Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 12/04/2018)

		T
12/11/2018	<u>19</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re 14 MOTION to Compel <i>Defendant to Produce a Vaught Index Or, Alternatively, In Camera Review</i> filed by United States Postal Service. (Attachments: # 1 LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 12/11/2018)
12/18/2018	<u>20</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson: Motion Hearing held on 12/18/2018 re 14 MOTION to Compel <i>Defendant to Produce a Vaughn Index Or, Alternatively, In Camera Review</i> filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (TMM) Modified text on 12/19/2018 (MMP). (Entered: 12/19/2018)
12/21/2018	<u>21</u>	ORDER denying <u>14</u> Motion to Compel(Written Opinion) Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 12/21/2018. (TMM) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/26/2018	<u>22</u>	ORDER OF REFERENCE: Pursuant to Title 28, United States Code, Section 636(b)(1), Defendant United States Postal Service's anticipated Glomar motion is referred to Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. Signed by Judge Wilhelmina M. Wright on 12/24/2018. (RE) (Entered: 12/26/2018)
12/31/2018	<u>23</u>	REQUEST <i>for Stay</i> by United States Postal Service. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 12/31/2018)
12/31/2018	<u>24</u>	PROPOSED ORDER TO JUDGE re <u>23</u> Request. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 12/31/2018)
01/02/2019	<u>25</u>	ORDER in Response to <u>23</u> Request. Defendant's Request for Stay is GRANTED. The deadlines in this case are hereby stayed, and the Status Conference scheduled for January 3, 2019 at 11:30 a.m. is hereby canceled and will be rescheduled after appropriations are restored. Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 1/2/2019. (DMM) (Entered: 01/02/2019)
01/28/2019	<u>26</u>	REQUEST <i>TO LIFT STAY</i> by United States Postal Service. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 01/28/2019)
01/28/2019	<u>27</u>	PROPOSED ORDER TO JUDGE re REQUEST TO LIFT STAY <u>26</u> Request. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 01/28/2019)
01/28/2019	<u>28</u>	ORDER GRANTING DEFENDANT'S REQUEST TO LIFT STAY. Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 1/28/2019. (MSK) (Entered: 01/28/2019)
02/13/2019	<u>29</u>	ORDER/NOTICE TO ATTORNEY. ORDER ON BRIEFING SCHEDULING AND NOTICE OF HEARING. Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 2/13/2019. (MSK) (Entered: 02/13/2019)
02/28/2019	<u>30</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Postal Service. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
02/28/2019	<u>31</u>	NOTICE OF HEARING ON MOTION <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment : Motion Hearing set for 4/3/2019 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6A (STP) before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
02/28/2019	<u>32</u>	MEMORANDUM in Support re 30 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Postal Service. (Attachments: # 1 LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
02/28/2019	<u>33</u>	Declaration of Dennis Nicoski in Support of <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Postal Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
02/28/2019	<u>34</u>	PROPOSED ORDER TO JUDGE re Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment 30 Motion for Summary Judgment. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 02/28/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>35</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>36</u>	NOTICE OF HEARING ON MOTION <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment: Motion Hearing set for 4/3/2019 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6A (STP) before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. (Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>37</u>	MEMORANDUM re <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment, <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of its Motion for Summary</i>

		Judgment 35 and Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment 30 filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Attachments: # 1 LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>38</u>	Declaration of Alex P. Hontos in Support of <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit(s) 1–46)(Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>39</u>	PROPOSED ORDER TO JUDGE re <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP.(Hull, Caitlin) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
03/21/2019	<u>40</u>	MEMORANDUM re <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment, <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Defendant's Response and Reply</i> filed by United States Postal Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 03/21/2019)
03/21/2019	<u>41</u>	Second Declaration of Dennis Nicoski in Support of <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Postal Service.(Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 03/21/2019)
03/21/2019	<u>42</u>	Declaration of Andrew Tweeten in Support of <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Postal Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit(s) E, # <u>2</u> Exhibit(s) F)(Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 03/21/2019)
03/29/2019	<u>43</u>	REPLY re <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Hontos, Alex) (Entered: 03/29/2019)
03/29/2019	<u>44</u>	Declaration of Alex P. Hontos in Support of <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit(s) 47)(Hontos, Alex) (Entered: 03/29/2019)
04/03/2019	<u>45</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson: Motion Hearing held on 4/3/2019 re 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP, 30 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Postal Service. (Court Reporter Lynne Krenz) (TMM) (Entered: 04/03/2019)
04/12/2019	46	(Text–only) NOTICE of Cancelation of Hearing: The Settlement Conference set for 5/9/2019 before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson is canceled. (MSK) (Entered: 04/12/2019)
05/09/2019	47	REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION re <u>35</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Dorsey & Whitney LLP, <u>30</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by United States Postal Service. Signed by Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson on 5/9/2019. (TMM) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/23/2019	<u>48</u>	OBJECTION to <u>47</u> Report and Recommendations as to Defendant. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Tweeten, Andrew) Modified text on 5/24/2019 (kt). (Entered: 05/23/2019)
05/24/2019	<u>49</u>	TRANSCRIPT REQUEST for an Expedited 14–Day Transcript of <u>45</u> Motion Hearing, to Court Reporter Lynne Krenz. (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 05/24/2019)
05/29/2019	<u>50</u>	NOTICE of Filing of Official Transcript. This filing has 1 transcript(s) associated with it. (LMK) (Entered: 05/29/2019)
05/29/2019	<u>51</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Motions Hearing held on 4.3.2019 before Magistrate Judge Becky R. Thorson. (56 pages). Court Reporter: Lynne Krenz. For a copy of the transcript, please file a Transcript Request under <i>Other Filings/Other Documents</i> .
		For information on redaction procedures, please review <u>Local Rule 5.5</u> . Redaction Request due 6/19/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 7/1/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 8/27/2019. (LMK) (Entered: 05/29/2019)
06/06/2019	<u>52</u>	RESPONSE re: <u>48</u> Objection to Report and Recommendation . (Attachments: # <u>1</u> LR7.1/LR72.2 Word Count Compliance Certificate)(Hull, Caitlin) Modified text on 6/6/2019 (MMG). (Entered: 06/06/2019)

07/02/2019	<u>53</u>	LETTER TO DISTRICT JUDGE by United States Postal Service . (Tweeten, Andrew) (Entered: 07/02/2019)
07/03/2019	<u>54</u>	LETTER TO DISTRICT JUDGE re: <u>53</u> by Dorsey & Whitney LLP . (Hull, Caitlin) Modified text on 7/3/2019 (KNK). (Entered: 07/03/2019)
09/03/2019	<u>55</u>	ORDER. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED: The May 9, 2019 R&R <u>47</u> is ADOPTED. (See order for details) (Written Opinion). Signed by Judge Wilhelmina M. Wright on 9/3/2019. (RJE) (Entered: 09/03/2019)